Soc 230A, Winter 2006

Comparative Ethnicity and Nationalism

Rogers Brubaker

230AB is a two-quarter sequence designed especially for students who are considering taking the field examination in Comparative Ethnicity and Nationalism. Space permitting, students from other departments with a serious interest in the material can be admitted with consent of the instructor; those interested should email the instructor describing their background and their reasons for wishing to take the course.

The course seeks to "decenter" prevailing American perspectives on ethnicity, race, and nationhood. In the broader literature, these concepts have wider meanings, and theoretical debates have different contours, than in the US. A comparative view helps to place the US experience in a broader context.

The course is based on the assumption that ethnicity, race, and nation belong to a broad family of forms of cultural understanding, social organization, and political contestation, all related to perceived similarities and differences of cultural background, social belonging, and political destiny. "Ethnicity" is the broadest term, including almost all of what we mean by "race" and much (but not all) of what we mean by nationhood and nationalism. "Race" is thus conceptualized as a particular form of ethnicity that emerges when phenotype becomes an important diacritical marker of difference. "Nation" -- insofar as it overlaps with ethnicity -- is taken as a specifically modern form of ethnicity that is understood to be based on common history, culture, and political destiny and to justify claims to an autonomous polity.

The course begins with ethnicity, understood broadly as embracing race and nationhood as well. After introductory discussions of basic concepts and empirical configurations, we devote a week to each of five broad approaches, emphasizing (1) the process of political modernization and state-building; (2) economic competition, social closure, and uneven development; (3) the cultural construction of boundaries, categories, and identities; (4) rational choice and micro-mechanisms; and (5) sociobiological, primordialist, and psychological accounts. In the second section of the course, we devote two weeks to race. In the spring quarter, the first five weeks will be devoted to nationhood and nationalism; the next three or four weeks to cross-cutting themes (e.g religion, gender, or conflict and violence) or exemplary works; and the final week or two to an examination of trajectories, diagnoses, and prospects, including questions of a possible movement "beyond" ethnicity, race, or nationalism.

This is a reading course, not a research seminar. No research, or research paper, is required. The course pivots on the critical examination of key writings in the field. This requires (1) close, critical reading of the literature assigned each week; (2) active participation in class discussion; (3) initiation of discussion, in the form of short (5-10 minute), clearly-focused presentations of key analytical issues by two (or in some cases three) students each week; and (4) preparation each week, after the first week, by all students (with one grace week allowed), of a short memorandum (one or two typed pages) developing, criticizing, or otherwise engaging an analytical issue, question, or problem raised by the reading. (This should not be a summary of the reading, but a response to the reading.)

The weekly memorandum is intended to inculcate the habit of writing as a natural accompaniment to all reflective reading. The memoranda will not be graded; but their submission is a firm requirement of the course.

The memoranda will be posted to an Annotation Board on the class web site. Using software developed by Mike Franks, members of the class will be able not only to read but to annotate one another's memoranda by adding footnotes with comments or questions keyed to particular passages in a memorandum.

So as to allow students and the instructors ample time to read the memoranda before class, the memoranda are to be posted to the web site **by midnight Tuesday** at the latest. Students will be expected to read each other's memoranda before class, and will be encouraged to annotate them. In this way participants can develop web-based discussions that parallel the classroom discussions.

Initiators of discussion should not, if possible, read a written text, and should not summarize the readings; rather, they should bring into focus the key analytical issues raised in the readings and pose analytical questions about or (if they wish) analytical criticisms of the readings.

At the end of the quarter, there will be a take-home final examination. The questions will be distributed at the last meeting of the class; the examination will be due in the Sociology Department office one week later.

Required readings are listed below by week.   **[subject to change]**

January 11

Introduction

January 18 : **Definitions and perspectives**

Weber, Max. 1978 [1922]. Economy and Society, eds. Guenther Roth and Claus Wittich. Berkeley: University of California Press, 385-398, 922-926

Cornell, Stephen and Douglas Hartmann. 1998. Ethnicity and Race: Making Identities in a Changing World. Thousand Oaks: Pine Forge Press, 15-38

Eriksen, Thomas H. 1993. Ethnicity and Nationalism: Anthropological Perspectives. London: Pluto Press: 1-17

Rothschild, Joseph. 1981. *Ethnopolitics: A Conceptual Framework*. New York: Columbia University Press, Introduction

Barth, Fredrik. 1969. Introduction to *Ethnic Groups and Boundaries: The Social Organization of Cultural Difference*, Boston: Little, Brown and Company.

Jenkins, Richard. 1997. *Rethinking Ethnicity: Arguments and Explorations*. London: Sage, pp. 9-15, 52-73.

Brubaker, Rogers. "Ethnicity without Groups"

January 25: **Contexts and configurations**

Fenton, *Ethnicity: Racism, Class and Culture*, pp 12-48.

Rothschild, Joseph. 1981. *Ethnopolitics: A Conceptual Framework*. New York: Columbia University Press, Chapter 2, and pp. 69-86.

Bell, Daniel. 1975. "Ethnicity and Social Change," in *Ethnicity: Theory and Experience,* pp. 141-152, 160-171, Edited by Nathan Glazer and Daniel P. Moynihan. Cambridge, M.A.: Harvard University Press.

Schermerhorn, R. A. 1970. Comparative Ethnic Relations: A Framework for Theory and Research. New York: Random House. 1970, 95-102

Horowitz, Donald L. 1985. Ethnic Groups in Conflict. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 6-12, 55-64, 74-83

Geertz, Clifford. 1963. "The Integrative Revolution." in Old Societies and New States: The Quest for Modernity in Asia and Africa, ed. Clifford Geertz. New York: Free Press of Glencoe. (pp 130-153 can be skimmed).

February 1: **Macro-political institutionalism**

Breuilly, *Nationalism and the State,* Conclusion

Brass, Paul R., ed. 1985. "Ethnic Groups and the State," in Brass, ed. *Ethnic Groups and the State*. Totowa, NJ: Barnes and Noble Books.

Rothschild, Joseph. 1981. *Ethnopolitics: A Conceptual Framework*. New York: Columbia University Press, Chapter 7

Wimmer, Andreas. 1997. "Who Owns the State? Understanding Ethnic Conflict in Post-Colonial Societies." *Nations and Nationalism* 3(4):631-65.

Brubaker, *Nationalism Reframed*, Chapter 2

February 8: **Competition and closure (cultural division of labor; labor market competition; middleman minorities)**

Weber, Max. 1978 [1922]. Economy and Society, eds. Guenther Roth and Claus Wittich. Berkeley: University of California Press, pp. 341-348

Glazer, Nathan and Daniel Patrick Moynihan. Introduction," pp. 1-11, in Ethnicity: Theory and Experience, Edited by Nathan Glazer and Daniel P. Moynihan. Cambridge, M.A.: Harvard University Press.

Olzak, Susan and Joane Nagel, eds. 1986. *Competitive Ethnic Relations*. Orlando: Academic Press. Pp. 1-5

Olzak, Susan. 1992. *The Dynamics of Ethnic Competition and Conflict*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, Chapters 3, 11

Hechter, Michael. 1975. *Internal Colonialism: The Celtic Fringe in British National Development, 1536-1966*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 3-43

Bonacich, Edna. 1973. "A Theory of Middleman Minorities." *American Sociological Review* 38:583-94.

Bates, Robert H. 1974. "Ethnic Competition and Modernization in Contemporary Africa." *Comparative Political Studies* 6(4):475-84.

Horowitz, Donald L. 1985. Ethnic Groups in Conflict. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 105-135

February 15: **Constructivism (boundary making; situationalism; political discourse; invention of tradition; cognitive approaches; racialization)**

Okamura, Jonathan Y. 1981. "Situational Ethnicity." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 4(4):452-65.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1991. "Identity and Representation: Elements for a Critical Reflection on the Idea of Region." Pp. 220-228 in *Language and Symbolic Power*, by Pierre Bourdieu. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Cornell, Stephen and Douglas Hartmann. 1998. *Ethnicity and Race: Making Identities in a Changing World*. Thousand Oaks: Pine Forge Press, Ch. 6

Moerman, Michael. 1965. "Ethnic Identification in a Complex Civilization: Who Are the Lue?" *American Anthropologist* 67(1):1215-30.

Nagel, Joane. 1995. "American Indian Ethnic Revival: Politics and the Resurgence of Identity." *American Sociological Review* 60:947-65.

Hobsbawm, Eric. 1983. "The Invention of Tradition," pp. 1-14 in Hobsbawm and Terence and Ranger, eds., The Invention of Tradition, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Brubaker, Rogers, Mara Loveman, and Peter Samatov. 2004. Ethnicity as Cognition. *Theory and Society* 33: 31-64

Lustick, Ian. "Agent Agent-Based Modeling and Constructivist Identity Theory" http://www.nd.edu/~apsacp/pdf/APSA-CP20Winter202001.pdf or Lustick, Ian. 2000. "Agent-based modelling of collective identity. Testing constructivist theory." *Journal of Artificial Societies and Social Simulations* 3,1

February 22

Rational choice (tipping point and cascade models; transaction cost argument; statistical discrimination)

Laitin, David D. 1995. "National Revivals and Violence." *Archives Européenes De Sociologie* 36(1):3-43.

Laitin, David D. 1995. "Marginality: A Microperspective." *Rationality and Society* 7(1):31-57.

de Swaan, Abram. 1998. "A Political Sociology of the World Language System (Parts 1 and 2) *Language Problems and Language Planning* 22(1):63-75; 22(2):109-28.

Richard McElreath, Robert Boyd and Peter J. Richerson. Shared Norms Can Lead to the Evolution of Ethnic Markers. Current Anthropology, 44: 122130, 2003

Kuran, Timur. 1998. "Ethnic Norms and Their Transformation Through Reputational Cascades." *Journal of Legal Studies* XXVII:623-59.

Hechter, Michael. 1992. "The Dynamics of Secession." *Acta Sociologica* 35(4):467-283.

Rogowski, Ronald. 1985. "Causes and varieties of nationalism: A rationalist account", Pp. 87-108 in Ronald Rogowski and Edward Tiryakian, *New Nationalism of the Developed World*. Boston: Allen & Unwin.

March 1

Limits to construction and competition (natural nepotism; primordialism; psychological roots; habitus and routinization; insights from genetics)

van den Berghe, Pierre L. 1981. *The Ethnic Phenomenon.* New York: Elsevier. 15-36

Gil-White, Francisco. 1999. "How Thick Is Blood? The Plot Thickens...: If Ethnic Actors Are Primordialists, What Remains of the Circumstantialist/Primordialist Controversy?" *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22(5):789-820

Kurzban, Robert, John Tooby, and Leda Cosmides. 2001. "Can Race be Erased? Coalitional Computation and Social Categorization." *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 98(26):15387-92.

Hirschfeld, Lawrence A. 1996. *Race in the Making: Cognition, Culture and the Child's Construction of Human Kinds*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press. 1996: 1-61, 187-198

Bentley, G. C. 1987. "Ethnicity and Practice." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 29:24-55.

Billig, Michael. 1995. *Banal Nationalism*. London: Sage, pp. 5-9, 37-46, 103-109

Bolnick, Deborah A. 2003. "Showing Who They Really Are: Commercial Ventures in Genetic Genealogy." Unpublished conference paper.

Brodwin, Paul "Genetics, Identity, and the Anthropology of Essentialism."

March 8

Race: Analytical approaches

Jenkins, Richard. 1997. *Rethinking Ethnicity: Arguments and Explorations.* London: Sage, pp. 74-87.

Sanjek, Roger. 1996. "Introduction" to Gregory and Sanjek, eds. *Race*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.

Wacquant, Loïc. 1997. "Towards an Analytic of Racial Domination." Political Power and Social Theory 11:221-234.

Omi, Michael and Howard Winant. 1994. *Racial Formation in the United States: From the 1960s to the 1990s*. 2nd ed. New York: Routledge. 9-23, 48-50, 53-76

Bonilla-Silva, Eduardo. 1997. "Rethinking Racism: Toward a Structural Interpretation." *American Sociological Review* 62(3):465-80

Loveman, Mara. 1999: "Is 'Race' Essential?" *American Sociological Review* 64(6):891-98; and Bonilla-Silva reply

March 15

Comparative perspectives on race

van den Berghe, Pierre L. 1978. *Race and Racism: A Comparative Perspective*. New York: Wiley. Pp 25-37, 112-131,132-150

Washington, Scott. 2004. "Principles of racial classification." Manuscript.

Wagley, Charles. 1965. "On the Concept of Social Race in the Americas." Pp. 531-45 in *Contemporary Cultures and Societies of Latin America*, eds. Dwight B. Heath and Richard N. Adams. New York: Random House.

Telles, Edward E. 2004. Race in Another America: The Significance of Skin Color in Brazil. Princeton: Princeton University Press. Pp. 78-106; 173-214

Marx, Anthony W. 1996. "Race-Making and the Nation-State." *World Politics* 48:180-208.

Loveman, Mara. 1999. "Making 'Race' and Nation in the United States, South Africa, and Brazil: Taking *Making* Seriously." *Theory and Society* 28(6):903-27

Dikötter, Frank, ed. 1977. Introduction and Chapter 1 in *The Construction of Racial Identities in China and Japan*. London: Hurst.